EMB

MINIREVIEW

Efflux as a mechanism for drug resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*

Pedro Eduardo Almeida da Silva¹, Andrea Von Groll^{1,2}, Anandi Martin² & Juan Carlos Palomino²

¹Universidade Federal do Rio Grande, Rio Grande, Brazil; and ²Mycobacteriology Unit, Institute of Tropical Medicine Antwerp, Belgium

Correspondence: Juan Carlos Palomino, Mycobacteriology Unit, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Nationalestraat 155, 2000 Antwerp, Belgium. Tel.: +32 3 247 6334; fax: +32 3 247 6333; e-mail: jcpalomino@itq.be

Received 13 January 2011; revised 7 June 2011; accepted 7 June 2011. Final version published opline 4 July 2011.

DOI:10.1111/j.1574-695X.2011.00831.x

Editor: Patrick Brennan

Keywords

tuberculosis; drug resistance; efflux; transporters; ATP-binding cassette; pumps.

Abstract

Tuberculosis remains an important global public health problem, with an estimated prevalence of 14 million individuals with tuberculosis worldwide in 2007. Because antibiotic treatment is one of the main tools for tuberculosis control, knowledge of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* drug resistance is an important component for the disease control strategy. Although several gene mutations in specific *loci* of the *M. tuberculosis* genome have been reported as the basis for drug resistance, additional resistance mechanisms are now believed to exist. Efflux is a ubiquitous mechanism responsible for intrinsic and acquired drug resistance in prokaryotic and eukaryotic cells. *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* presents one of the largest numbers of putative drug efflux pumps compared with its genome size. Bioinformatics as well as direct and indirect evidence have established relationships among drug efflux with intrinsic or acquired resistance in *M. tuberculosis*. This minireview describes the current knowledge on drug efflux in *M. tuberculosis*.

Introduction

The high mortality and morbidity associated with tuberculosis (TB), especially in poor countries, is one of the features characterizing tuberculosis as a major public health concern worldwide. In the absence of a more effective vaccine, chemotherapy is one of the main tuberculosis control tools. There is an important increase in the prevalence of tuberculosis cases in several settings with multidrug- and extensively-drug resistance rates on the rise (World Health Organization, 2010b). Multidrug-resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB) is caused by strains of Mycobacterium tuberculosis that are resistant to at least rifampicin and isoniazid, two key drugs in the treatment of the disease. Extensively drug resistant tuberculosis(XDR-TB), on the other hand, is caused by strains of M. tuberculosis that, in addition to being MDR, are also resistant to any quinolone and to one of the three injectable second-line drugs: kanamycin, capreomycin or amikacin (Migliori et al., 2007). Patients with MDR-TB are treated following the recommendations of the WHO according to defined parameters (World Health Organization, 2010a). There are no official specific recommendations for the treatment of patients with XDR-TB, although positive experiences have been reported (Bonilla et al., 2008). Patients with XDR-TB have fewer options for treatment and risk higher mortalities, especially in HIV-coinfected persons, as has been reported earlier (Gandhi *et al.*, 2006).

Although new candidate drugs are under development, it will probably take several years until one new anti-tuberculosis drug becomes available, stressing the need to better understand the mechanisms of resistance to the currently available drugs and to reduce the incidence of drug-resistant cases (Dye, 2009).

Intrinsic drug resistance in *M. tuberculosis* has been attributed to a combination of a highly impermeable mycolic acid-containing cell wall and an active drug efflux mechanism (Jarlier & Nikaido, 1994; De Rossi *et al.*, 2006). Acquired drug resistance, on the other hand, does not occur by horizontal gene transfer as in other microorganisms, because *M. tuberculosis* lack plasmids and genomic DNA transfer has not been described, occurring instead by spontaneous mutations in specific target genes rendering the bacteria resistant to a given drug (Ramaswamy & Musser, 1998). This has to be distinguished from the clinical definition of acquired drug resistance, defined as resistance to one or more drugs in *M. tuberculosis* strains recovered from patients who have received previous anti-tuberculosis treatment (World Health Organization, 1997).

Our knowledge of drug resistance in *M. tuberculosis* has increased considerably in the last 20 years. Gene mutations

Table 1. Efflux pumps for anti-tuberculosis drugs

Drug efflux pump	Transporter family	Drug	References
Rv1258c	MFS	STR RIF, OFX, INH*	Aínsa et al. (1998), Jiang et al. (2008)
Rv1410c	MFS	STR,INH, RIF	Silva et al. (2001), Jiang et al. (2008)
Rv1634	MFS	FQ	De Rossi <i>et al.</i> (2002)
Rv2459	MFS	INH, EMB	Gupta <i>et</i> al. (2010a, b)
Rv2846c (EfpA)	MFS	INH, ETH	Wilson <i>et al</i> . (1999)
DrrABC	ABC	EMB, FQ, STR	Choudhuri et al. (2002)
Rv2686c-Rv2687c-Rv2688c	ABC	FQ	Pasca et al. (2004)
Rv0194	ABC	STR	Danilchanka et al. (2008)
MmpL	RND	INH	Pasca et al. (2005)

STR, streptomycin; RIF, rifampicin; OFX, ofloxacin; INH, isoniazid; FQ, fluoroquinolones; ETH, ethionamide; EMB, ethambutol.

in several *loci* have now been characterized as the main basis for drug resistance (Zhang & Telenti, 2000). However, in a certain proportion of clinical isolates, resistance cannot be explained by the presence of gene mutations as it occurs in up to 30% of isoniazid-resistant or in around 5% of rifampicin-resistant clinical isolates of *M. tuberculosis*, suggesting that other mechanisms of drug resistance must exist (Louw *et al.*, 2009). Among these, efflux has been proposed as the basis for drug resistance in clinical isolates lacking previously described gene mutations (Escribano *et al.*, 2007; Spies *et al.*, 2008)

Drug efflux, where a transporter is capable of extruding multiple drugs without apparent common structural similarity, was first described in eukaryotic cells. (Ambudkar et al., 1992, 1999). Soon, it became apparent that multidrug efflux systems were also present in several microorganisms (McMurry et al., 1980; Nikaido, 1998; Paulsen & Lewis, 2001).

More recently, drug efflux has been described as an important mechanism for intrinsic and acquired drug resistance in numerous prokaryotic and eukaryotic cells (Levy, 1992; Nikaido & Zgurskaya, 1999; Li *et al.*, 2003, 2004; Webber & Piddock, 2003; Piddock, 2006a). Drug efflux has also been associated with pathogenicity, virulence, biofilm formation and quorum sensing (Piddock, 2006b; Bina *et al.*, 2009; Chan & Chua, 2010; Høiby *et al.*, 2010). Not all the currently available antituberculosis drugs, however, are considered as substrates of efflux mechanisms (Palomino *et al.*, 2009).

Analysis of the available bacterial genomes has shown that putative drug efflux pumps (EPs) constitute 6–18% of all transporters found in any given bacterial cell. *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* presents one of the largest numbers of putative EPs compared with its genome size (Paulsen *et al.*, 2001). Consequently, active drug efflux systems have been shown to be present in mycobacteria (Sander *et al.*, 2000; Pasca *et al.*, 2005), extruding structurally and functionally unrelated compounds, and for this reason, they are also known as MDR EPs. The mechanisms for the induction and regulation of these EPs are not yet fully understood.

Moreover, their implication in clinical drug resistance needs to be completely elucidated (Putman *et al.*, 2000). This minireview summarizes our current knowledge on EPs in *M. tuberculosis* taking into account bioinformatics as well as direct and indirect evidence (Table 1).

Drug efflux in the genus Mycobacterium

In *Mycobacterium smegmatis* as well as in other mycobacteria, the cell wall, rich in mycolic acids, functions as an efficient barrier limiting the access of several molecules including antibiotics. However, this is not enough for explaining the intrinsic drug resistance of these microorganisms (Li *et al.*, 2004).

Although efflux mechanisms have been studied in several mycobacteria (Aínsa et al., 1998; Nomura et al., 2004; Ramon-Garcia et al., 2006; Rodrigues et al., 2008), for practical reasons, M. smegmatis has been used as the model system for expressing heterologous putative EP genes and to study the efflux mechanism itself (Liu et al., 1996; Takiff et al., 1996; De Rossi et al., 1998a; Silva et al., 2001; Pasca et al., 2005; Kim et al., 2008).

The first EP characterized in mycobacteria was the LfrA present in *M. smegmatis* that, expressed in multicopy plasmids, confers low-level resistance to fluoroquinolones, ethidium bromide, acridine and some quaternary ammonium compounds (Liu *et al.*, 1996; Takiff *et al.*, 1996).

Other EPs initially characterized in mycobacteria were TetV, conferring resistance to tetracycline (De Rossi *et al.*, 1998a), and Tap, which confers low-level resistance to aminoglycosides and tetracycline when overexpressed in *M. smegmatis* (Aínsa *et al.*, 1998). These reports can be considered as precursors of the different studies of drug efflux in *M. tuberculosis* that will be described below.

Putative EPs in M. tuberculosis

EPs, also known as transporters, have been classified into five superfamilies: ATP-binding cassette (ABC), major facilitator super-family (MFS), resistance nodulation division (RND), small multidrug resistance (SMR) and multidrug

and toxic-compound extrusion (MATE). While MFS, SMR, RND and MATE members are secondary transporters, typically energized by the proton motive force (H⁺ or Na⁺), members of the ABC superfamily use ATP as the energy source and are considered as primary transporters (Tseng *et al.*, 1999; Putman *et al.*, 2000; Cattoir, 2004; Li & Nikaido, 2009; Saier *et al.*, 2009).

The ABC superfamily is a large and ancient family that consists of 52 subfamilies comprising uptake or efflux systems for a wide range of substrates including drugs, sugars, amino acids, carboxylates, metal ions and peptides (Paulsen et al., 2001). ABC transporters have been associated with the acquisition of drug resistance in mycobacteria. The gene cluster drrA-drrB-drrC, with high similarity to an ABC exporter of daunorubicin in various Streptomyces species, determines resistance to a broad range of clinically relevant antibiotics when overexpressed in M. smegmatis (Guilfoile & Hutchinson, 1991; Choudhuri et al., 2002). Another ABC transporter coded by the genes Rv2686c-Rv2687c-Rv2688c when overexpressed in M. smegmatis increased by eightfold the minimum inhibitory concentrations (MIC) of ciprofloxacin when the entire operon was overexpressed and by fourfold when only Rv2686c was overexpressed (Pasca et al., 2004).

In *M. tuberculosis*, genes coding for ABC transporters represent 2.5% of its entire genome and by sequence analysis at least 12 putative EP genes have been identified: Rv0194, Rv1218c-Rv1217c, Rv1273c-Rv1272c, Rv1348-Rv1349, Rv1456c-Rv1457c-Rv1458c, Rv1473, Rv1667c-Rv1668c, Rv1686c-Rv1687c, Rv1819, Rv2477, Rv2688c-Rv2687c-Rv2686c and *drrA-drrB-drrC* (Braibant *et al.*, 2000).

A novel ABC multidrug EP was identified in M. tuberculosis while investigating the molecular mechanisms for resistance to β -lactam antibiotics (Danilchanka et al., 2008). Rv0194 was identified not only as an EP involved in resistance to β -lactams in M. tuberculosis, but it was also found that low-level expression of rv0194 increased the resistance of $Mycobacterium\ bovis\ BCG$ to several antibiotics.

More recently, Balganesh *et al.* (2010) characterized another new major ABC transporter in *M. tuberculosis* found to be responsible for the efflux of a wide variety of substrates including novobiocins, pyrazolones, biarylpiperazines, bisanilinopyrimidines, pyrroles and pyridones. MICs of these compounds were decreased by four- to eightfold in mutants lacking *Rv1218c* compared with the wild-type strain.

Until now, however, the role of ABC EPs in conferring clinically relevant resistance to multiple drugs has not been described (Piddock, 2006a).

Bioinformatics tools (http://www.membranetransport. org/) have identified up to 20 potential EP genes belonging to the MFS drug transporters in the *M. tuberculosis* genome (Saier *et al.*, 2009). Furthermore, by sequence and motif similarity to EPs present in several microorganisms, at least 16 putative EP genes of this family have been identified in

M. tuberculosis: Rv0037c, Rv0191, Rv0783c, Rv0849, Rv1250, Rv1258c, Rv1410c, Rv1634, Rv1877, Rv2333c, Rv2456c, Rv2459, Rv2846c (efpA), Rv28994, Rv3239c and Rv3728 (De Rossi et al., 2002). The Tap protein and LfrA mentioned before are EPs belonging to the MFS family conferring resistance to tetracycline and fluoroquinolones, respectively (Takiff et al., 1996; Aínsa et al., 1998). Also, P55, the protein encoded by the Rv1410c gene, was characterized as a multidrug EP of the MFS family in M. tuberculosis and M. bovis conferring resistance to streptomycin and tetracycline (Silva et al., 2001). P55 has been recently been shown to require the cell surface LprG lipoprotein to function properly (Farrow & Rubin, 2008), with both proteins being critical for the survival of M. tuberculosis during infection (Bigi et al., 2004).

The Mmr protein of *M. tuberculosis* has been identified as a multidrug EP of the SMR family that confers resistance to acriflavine, ethidium bromide and erythromycin in *M. smegmatis* when expressed in a multicopy vector (De Rossi *et al.*, 1998b).

EPs of the RND family are most commonly found in Gram-negative bacteria. In M. tuberculosis, the mmpL7 gene that encodes a putative RND transporter confers a high-level resistance to isoniazid when overexpressed in M. smegmatis (Pasca et al., 2005). This resistance was reversed in the presence of EP inhibitors. More recently, on characterizing several azole-resistant spontaneous mutants of M. tuberculosis and M. bovis BCG, an increased econazole efflux and an increased transcription of mmpS5-mmpL5 genes that encode a hypothetical EP of the RND family were also found. Furthermore, it has been demonstrated that upregulation of these genes was linked to mutations in either the Rv0678 gene, its hypothetical transcriptional regulator or in its putative promoter/operator region (Milano et al., 2009). Interestingly, the M. tuberculosis genome revealed the presence of 15 putative transmembrane proteins, predicted to belong to the RND family (http://genolist.pasteur.fr/Tuber cuList/). Because these proteins showed some characteristics restricted to mycobacteria they were designated MmpL (mycobacterial membrane proteins, large).

Transporters belonging to the MATE family have not been reported in mycobacteria, being more common in *Escherichia coli* and *Vibrio* sp. (Li & Nikaido, 2004).

Overexpression and antimicrobial resistance profile

Using *M. smegmatis* or *M. bovis* as expression hosts and plasmids carrying genes coding for putative EPs in *M. tuberculosis*, increased resistance to several drugs has been reported. Using this approach, Rv1258c and Rv1410 (P55) encoding MFS transporters, produced resistance to tetracycline and aminoglycosides. Similarly, overexpression

of Rv1634, another MFS family member, was found to confer resistance to fluoroquinolones (Silva *et al.*, 2001; De Rossi *et al.*, 2002).

The study by Ramon-Garcia *et al.* (2007) showed that the *stp* gene (Rv2333c) from *M. tuberculosis* conferred resistance to spectinomycin and tetracycline when expressed in *M. bovis* BCG. Overexpression studies have also shown that Rv0194 that codes for an ABC-type EP conferred MDR in *M. bovis* BCG and *M. smegmatis* and also reduced the accumulation of ethidium bromide in the latter (Danilchanka *et al.*, 2008).

More recently, using recombinant strains of *M. tuberculosis* H37Ra, the overexpression of Rv2459 (*jefA*) led to an increase in the MICs of isoniazid and ethambutol. These MIC values decreased again when the bacteria were grown in the presence of the EP inhibitors carbonyl cyanide m-chlorophenyl hydrazone (CCCP) and verapamil. Bioinformatics analyses have also shown a close relation of the JefA protein with drug EPs in other clinically relevant bacteria (Gupta *et al.*, 2010b).

Drug-induced EPs

Although the overexpression of genes coding for putative EPs has been a widely used strategy, exploring drug-induced alterations in gene expression has also been used to associate several EPs with different drugs.

Using this approach, Siddiqi et al. (2004) reported a MDR clinical isolate of M. tuberculosis that, when grown in the presence of subinhibitory concentrations of rifampicin and ofloxacin, showed increased transcription of the gene Rv1258c that encodes a tap-like EP. Although drug resistance-associated mutations were detected in gyrA and rpoB, it was hypothesized that the high level of resistance to rifampicin and ofloxacin could reflect an additional overexpression of the gene Rv1258c. Similar results were obtained in another study with a clinical MDR isolate in which the expression of Rv1258c and Rv1410c was significantly increased in the presence of rifampicin or isoniazid (Jiang et al., 2008). Another study that supports the involvement of Rv1258c as a putative EP in M. tuberculosis has been reported by Sharma et al. (2010), showing that piperine, a trans-trans isomer of 1-piperoyl-piperidine, inhibited the clinically overexpressed Rv1258c gene.

One of the first studies to use genome-wide expression analysis in the presence of an antibiotic was reported by Wilson and colleagues. In this study, using microarray hybridization and induced gene expression, it was found that isoniazid and ethionamide increased the expression of *efpA*, a member of the MFS family of EPs (Wilson *et al.*, 1999). A more recent study by Gupta *et al.* (2010a), using a DNA microarray with 25 drug EP genes of *M. tuberculosis*, found overexpression of 10 genes after exposure to various

anti-tuberculosis drugs. These included Rv3065 and Rv2938, already reported as active drug EPs in M. tuberculosis in previous studies, and eight other EP genes reported for the first time (Rv1819, Rv2209, Rv2459, Rv2477c, Rv2688, Rv2846, Rv2994 and Rv3728). The simultaneous overexpression of the EP genes Rv2459, Rv3728 and Rv3065 was associated with resistance to the combination of isoniazid and ethambutol that, along with streptomycin, were identified to group together, signaling their probable importance in the development of MDR in M. tuberculosis. An interesting study has reported the induction of high-level resistance to isoniazid (up to $20 \,\mu g \, mL^{-1}$) in M. tuberculosis, which could be reduced 100-fold by subinhibitory concentrations of reserpine, supporting the argument that induced drug resistance might be due to an EP mechanism (Viveiros et al., 2002).

Finally, expression of Rv0341, Rv0342 and Rv0343 (*iniB*, *iniA* and *iniC*, respectively) is induced by isoniazid or ethambutol. It has been proposed that *iniA*, albeit not a typical EP, could be functioning like an MDR-pump system (Colangeli *et al.*, 2005).

The use of EPs inhibitors as a possible alternative or adjuvant in antituberculosis therapy has been considered as an interesting option since some time ago. Shortening the duration of tuberculosis treatment and reducing the spread of drug resistance are high priorities for the control of the disease. The effects of EP inhibitors in reducing the resistance to antibiotics have been clearly shown in other bacteria (Aeschlimann et al., 1999). Considering tuberculosis, Amaral et al. (2008) have recently argued on the possibility of using thioridazine, an inhibitor of EPs, in the treatment of MDR/XDR-TB. Thioridazine has been found previously to be active in killing intracellular MDR M. tuberculosis at concentrations below those normally present in the plasma of patients (Ordway et al., 2003). Similarly, a recent study has reported promising therapeutic activity of thioridazine in a mouse model of MDR-TB (Van Soolingen et al., 2010). Another study has shown that the addition of verapamil, a known EP inhibitor, to first-line anti-tuberculosis drugs significantly reduced CFU in the lungs of mice after 1 and 2 months of treatment (Louw et al., 2011). Taking these results into account, further clinical trials might be warranted to assess whether these compounds may be safely and efficiently used as an adjunct therapy in tuberculosis.

Putative transcriptional regulator of EP genes

Several examples of the transcriptional regulation of EP genes have been described in the literature. The TetR-like transcriptional repressor LfrR regulates the expression of *lfrA* and it has been shown that some compounds such as

acriflavine, ethidium bromide or rhodamine 123 enhance the expression of this local regulator. Gene disruption in the native host rendered the mutant more susceptible to multiple drugs such as fluoroquinolones, ethidium bromide and acriflavine (Buroni *et al.*, 2006; Bellinzoni *et al.*, 2009).

In *M. tuberculosis*, an antibiotic tolerance system similar to the MDR system present in *Actinobacter* sp has been described. This system is dependent on *whiB7*, which is induced by subinhibitory concentrations of antibiotics. Expression of *whiB7* was found to be increased fivefold in the late exponential and early stationary phases, with a subsequent decline to control levels in the late stationary phase of growth. Gene expression analysis showed that transcription of *whiB7* determined drug resistance by activating the expression of a regulon that includes Rv1258c and Rv1473 (Morris *et al.*, 2005; Geiman *et al.*, 2006).

MarA is another transcriptional regulator that, in E. coli, is related to an increase of drug efflux and, when overexpressed in M. smegmatis, resulted in an increased resistance to rifampicin, isoniazid, ethambutol, tetracycline and chloramphenicol. MarA was mainly associated with a positive regulation of an EP of the RND family of transporters (McDermott et al., 1998). In M. tuberculosis, Schaller et al. (2002) observed that low concentrations of salicylate induced resistance to different drugs such as rifampicin, isoniazid, ethambutol and streptomycin. Although salicylate can also induce antibiotic resistance through a Mar-independent pathway, it is possible to infer the presence of a transcriptional activator like MarA in M. tuberculosis (Cohen et al., 1993). In fact, Rv1931c, Rv3736 and Rv3833 present in the M. tuberculosis genome show 30% identity to MarA and could be related to an EP gene overexpression (http://genolist.pasteur.fr/TubercuList/).

It remains to be seen and investigated how these mechanisms of transcriptional regulation occur in real life and whether they are responsible for clinically relevant drug resistance in *M. tuberculosis*.

EPs and virulence

It has been recently shown that there is a relationship between EPs and virulence. In some bacteria, EPs can also export virulence determinants such as adhesins, toxins or other proteins that are important for colonization and persistence in human and animal cells (Piddock, 2006b).

The survival of *M. tuberculosis* in the macrophage depends on its capacity to obstruct the normal maturation of the phagosome. Isolation of defective mutants unable to arrest phagosome maturation showed that some affected genes were homologues of putative EPs and lipid synthesis enzymes. One such mutant had a knockout in Rv1819c, which is characterized as a putative EP of the ABC family. It is interesting to note that an increasing number of MDR

ABC transporters have been shown to transport lipids. Thus, it is feasible that Rv1819c might also be responsible for the transport of lipids to the exterior of the bacterium (Borst *et al.*, 2000; Pethe *et al.*, 2004).

In *M. tuberculosis* lprG (Rv1411) and P55 (Rv1410) form an operon. Mutants ΔRv1411 of *M. tuberculosis* H37Rv do not produce LprG or P55 and result in attenuated strains in a mouse model of infection, confirming that lprG is required for the growth of *M. tuberculosis* in immunocompetent mice (Bigi *et al.*, 2004). However, conservation of the operon in the nonpathogenic *M. smegmatis* suggests that the protein is at least partially necessary in environmental mycobacteria. It has also been shown in *M. smegmatis* that the lprG-Rv1410c operon is required for resistance to ethidium bromide and for maintaining a normal cell surface composition. (Farrow & Rubin, 2008). More recently, the role of P55 in the oxidative stress response and normal growth *in vitro* has been reported (Ramón-García *et al.*, 2009).

Recently, Domenech et al. (2009) showed that the ABC transporter encoded by Rv1819c, which shares 39% similarity to the BacA protein of Brucella abortus, plays a significant role in the maintenance of extended chronic tuberculosis infection in mice. Mycobacterium tuberculosis strains deficient in BacA showed no compromise of the membrane integrity, but had increased resistance to bleomycin. Expression of this BacA homologue in E. coli conferred resistance to antimicrobial peptides (Domenech et al., 2009). It is not known by which mechanism the BacA deficiency causes this attenuation of infection in mice; however, it has been reported that in B. abortus bacA mutants induce larger amounts of proinflammatory cytokines compared with the parental strain (Parent et al., 2007). While BacA does not appear to contribute directly to drug efflux or efflux of components of the M. tuberculosis cell wall, it may be involved in the transport of certain antimicrobial peptides important in determining the progression of infection in the host.

A recent interesting study has been reported by Dutta et al. (2010) analyzing the effects of thioridazine in M. tuberculosis. On analyzing gene expression profiles after the treatment of M. tuberculosis with thioridazine, it was found that the drug modulated the expression of genes coding for membrane proteins, EPs, oxidoreductases and enzymes of fatty acid metabolism and aerobic respiration. The authors hypothesize that thioridazine also damages the cell envelope of the bacteria and turns on the expression of the sigmaB regulon that has been shown to be responsible for the protection of M. tuberculosis from envelope damage (Fontán et al., 2009).

Concluding remarks

Bioinformatics and experimental data showing the relationship between efflux mechanisms and drug resistance in

M. tuberculosis have stressed the need to further our knowledge on the mechanisms of drug resistance in tuberculosis.

It is necessary to better identify the correlation between EP gene expression and their inducers, both under environmental conditions and in the presence of drugs. Although the EPs described in *M. tuberculosis* show a narrow spectrum of substrates, point mutations could radically alter the spectrum of substrates as has been described in other microorganisms (Klyachko & Neyfakh, 1998).

Molecular analysis using multicopy plasmids or gene knockouts has the advantage of identifying the precise *locus* involved in efflux-mediated resistance; however, its limitation is the limited approach on the complex interaction between the EP, the regulatory proteins and several inducers. Phenotypic methods, on the other hand, have the advantage of identifying integral efflux mechanisms as a result of the broad interaction of several genes responsible for efflux, but they are unable to determine the specific EP involved. While the role of efflux in acquired and intrinsic drug resistance is not completely elucidated, it is possible to consider this mechanism as a factor contributing to clinical drug resistance working in synergy with other mechanisms of resistance such as impermeability of the cell wall and drug resistance mutations.

Regarding clinical practice, the detection of drug efflux remains an important goal because it allows identifying the mechanisms that could be related to an increase in drug resistance. For this reason, it would be important to develop accurate and simple diagnostic methods that could identify and characterize efflux events. Along this line, although not yet used routinely, MIC determination in the presence or absence of known efflux inhibitors or evaluation of substrate accumulation using radiolabeled substrates or instrument-free methods have been proposed (Martins *et al.*, 2006; Viveiros *et al.*, 2008).

Our current knowledge on EPs indicates that efflux inhibitors could become candidate tools to treat infectious diseases (Lomovskaya & Bostian, 2006; Piddock, 2006a). Certain compounds already in use in clinical practice for other purposes, such as verapamil, reserpine and omeprazole, are capable of inhibiting efflux mechanisms in several eukaryotic and prokaryotic cells. However, they have been mostly active at concentrations higher than those used clinically (Kaatz, 2002).

In conclusion, several compounds that inhibit efflux activity have been synthesized or obtained from natural sources, but none of them are currently being used to treat infectious diseases (Yamada *et al.*, 1997; Lomovskaya *et al.*, 2001; Kaatz, 2005). Considering the limited number of antimicrobials available for the treatment of tuberculosis and the unquestionable relationship between efflux and drug resistance in *M. tuberculosis*, it is urgent to deepen our knowledge on drug efflux as well as to develop compounds that could offset this resistance mechanism.

Acknowledgement

The authors wish to acknowledge the funding support of the European Commission Seven Framework Programme (FAST-XDR-DETECT Project FP7-HEALTH-2007-A-201690 and NOPERSIST Project FP7-SME-2008-1-232188), as well as from CAPES and CNPq (Brazil). The authors declare that they do not have any conflicts of interest to declare.

References

- Aeschlimann JR, Dresser LD, Kaatz GW & Rybak MJ (1999) Effects of NorA inhibitors on *in vitro* antibacterial activities and postantibiotic effects of levofloxacin, ciprofloxacin, and norfloxacin in genetically related strains of *Staphylococcus aureus*. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **43**: 335–340.
- Aínsa JA, Blokpoel MC, Otal I, Young DB, De Smet KA & Martín C (1998) Molecular cloning and characterization of Tap, a putative multidrug efflux pump present in *Mycobacterium fortuitum* and *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *J Bacteriol* **180**: 5836–5843.
- Amaral L, Martins M, Viveiros M, Molnar J & Kristiansen JE (2008) Promising therapy of XDR-TB/MDR-TB with thioridazine an inhibitor of bacterial efflux pumps. *Curr Drug Targets* **9**: 816–819.
- Ambudkar SV, Lelong IH, Zhang J, Cardarelli CO, Gottesman MM & Pastan I (1992) Partial purification and reconstitution of the human multidrug-resistance pump: characterization of the drug-stimulatable ATP hydrolysis. *P Natl Acad Sci USA* **89**: 8472–8476.
- Ambudkar SV, Dey S, Hrycyna CA & Cardarelli C (1999) Biochemical, cellular, and pharmacological aspects of the multidrug transporter. *Annu Rev Pharmacol* **39**: 361–398.
- Balganesh M, Kuruppath S, Marcel N, Sharma S, Nair A & Sharma U (2010) Rv1218c, an ABC Transporter of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* with Implications in Drug Discovery. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **54**: 5167–5172.
- Bellinzoni M, Buroni S, Schaeffer F, Riccardi G, De Rossi E & Alzari PM (2009) Structural plasticity and distinct drugbinding modes of LfrR, a mycobacterial efflux pump regulator. *J Bacteriol* **191**: 7531–7537.
- Bigi F, Gioffre A, Klepp L *et al.* (2004) The knockout of the lprG-Rv1410 operon produces strong attenuation of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Microbes Infect* **6**: 182–187.
- Bina XR, Philippart JA & Bina JE (2009) Effect of the efflux inhibitors 1-(1-naphthylmethyl)-piperazine and phenylarginine-beta-naphthylamide on antimicrobial susceptibility and virulence factor production in *Vibrio cholerae*. *I Antimicrob Chemoth* 63: 103–108.
- Bonilla CA, Crossa A, Jave HO *et al.* (2008) Management of extensively drug-resistant tuberculosis in Peru: cure is possible. *PLoS One* **3**: e2957.
- Borst P, Zelcer N & van Helvoort A (2000) ABC transporters in lipid transport. *Biochim Biophys Acta* **1486**: 128–144.

- Braibant M, Gilot P & Content J (2000) The ATP binding cassette (ABC) transport systems of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *FEMS Microbiol Rev* **24**: 449–467.
- Buroni S, Manina G, Guglierame P, Pasca MR, Riccardi G & De Rossi E (2006) LfrR is a repressor that regulates expression of the efflux pump LfrA in *Mycobacterium smegmatis*. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **50**: 4044–4052.
- Cattoir V (2004) Efflux-mediated antibiotics resistance in bacteria. Pathol Biol 52: 607–616.
- Chan YY & Chua KL (2010) Growth-related changes in intracellular spermidine and its effect on efflux pump expression and quorum sensing in Burkholderia pseudomallei. *Microbiology* **156**: 1144–1154.
- Choudhuri BS, Bhakta S, Barik R, Basu J, Kundu M & Chakrabarti P (2002) Overexpression and functional characterization of an ABC (ATP-binding cassette) transporter encoded by the genes *drrA* and *drrB* of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Biochem J* **367**: 279–285.
- Cohen SP, Levy SB, Foulds J & Rosner JL (1993) Salicylate induction of antibiotic resistance in *Escherichia coli*: activation of the mar operon and a mar-independent pathway. *J Bacteriol* 175: 7856–7862.
- Colangeli R, Helb D, Sridharan S *et al.* (2005) *Mycobacterium tuberculosis iniA* gene is essential for activity of an efflux pump that confers drug tolerance to both isoniazid and ethambutol. *Mol Microbiol* **55**: 1829–1840.
- Danilchanka O, Mailaender C & Niederweis M (2008) Identification of a novel multidrug efflux pump of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis. Antimicrob Agents Ch* **52**: 2503–2511.
- De Rossi E, Blokpoel MC, Cantoni R, Branzoni M, Riccardi G, Young DB, De Smet KA & Ciferri O (1998a) Molecular cloning and functional analysis of a novel tetracycline resistance determinant, tet(V), from *Mycobacterium smegmatis*.

 Antimicrob Agents Ch 42: 1931–1937.
- De Rossi E, Branzoni M, Cantoni R, Milano A, Riccardi G & Ciferri O (1998b) *mmr*, a *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* gene conferring resistance to small cationic dyes and inhibitors. *J Bacteriol* **180**: 6068–6071.
- De Rossi E, Arrigo P, Bellinzoni M, Silva PA, Martín C, Aínsa JA, Guglierame P & Riccardi G (2002) The multidrug transporters belonging to major facilitator superfamily in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Mol Med* **8**: 714–724.
- De Rossi E, Ainsa JA & Riccardi G (2006) Role of mycobacterial efflux transporters in drug resistance: an unresolved question. *FEMS Microbiol Rev* **30**: 36–52.
- Domenech P, Kobayashi H, LeVier K, Walker GC & Barry CE (2009) BacA, an ABC transporter involved in maintenance of chronic murine infections with *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *J Bacteriol* **191**: 477–485.
- Dutta NK, Mehra S & Kaushal D (2010) A *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* sigma factor network responds to cell-envelope damage by the promising anti-mycobacterial thioridazine. *PLoS One* **5**: e10069.

- Dye C (2009) Doomsday postponed? Preventing and reversing epidemics of drug-resistant tuberculosis. *Nat Rev Microbiol* 7: 81–87.
- Escribano I, Rodriguez JC, Llorca B, García-Pachon E, Ruiz M & Royo G (2007) Importance of the efflux pump systems in the resistance of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* to fluoroquinolones and linezolid. *Chemotherapy* **53**: 397–401.
- Farrow MF & Rubin EJ (2008) Function of a mycobacterial major facilitator superfamily pump requires a membrane-associated lipoprotein. *J Bacteriol* **190**: 1783–1791.
- Fontán PA, Voskuil MI, Gomez M, Tan D, Pardini M, Manganelli R, Fattorini L, Schoolnik GK & Smith I (2009) The *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* sigma factor sigmaB is required for full response to cell envelope stress and hypoxia *in vitro*, but it is dispensable for *in vivo* growth. *J Bacteriol* 191: 5628–5633.
- Gandhi NR, Moll A, Sturm AW, Pawinski R, Govender T, Lalloo U, Zeller K, Andrews J & Friedland G (2006) Extensively drugresistant tuberculosis as a cause of death in patients co-infected with tuberculosis and HIV in a rural area of South Africa. *Lancet* **368**: 1575–1580.
- Geiman DE, Raghunand TR, Agarwal N & Bishai WR (2006)
 Differential gene expression in response to exposure to
 antimycobacterial agents and other stress conditions among
 seven *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* whiB-like genes. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **50**: 2836–2841.
- Guilfoile PG & Hutchinson CR (1991) A bacterial analog of the mdr gene of mammalian tumor cells is present in *Streptomyces peucetius*, the producer of daunorubicin and doxorubicin. *P Natl Acad Sci USA* **88**: 8553–8557.
- Gupta AK, Katoch VM, Chauhan DS, Sharma R, Singh M, Venkatesan K & Sharma VD (2010a) Microarray analysis of efflux pump genes in multidrug-resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* during stress induced by common antituberculous drugs. *Microb Drug Resist* **16**: 21–28.
- Gupta AK, Reddy VP, Lavania M, Chauhan DS, Venkatesan K, Sharma VD, Tyagi AK & Katoch VM (2010b) jefA (Rv2459), a drug efflux gene in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* confers resistance to isoniazid & ethambutol. *Indian J Med Res* 132: 176–188.
- Høiby N, Ciofu O & Bjarnsholt T (2010) *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* biofilms in cystic fibrosis. *Future Microbiol* **5**: 1663–1674.
- Jarlier V & Nikaido H (1994) Mycobacterial cell wall: structure and role in natural resistance to antibiotics. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **123**: 11–18.
- Jiang X, Zhang W, Zhang Y, Gao F, Lu C, Zhang X & Wang H (2008) Assessment of efflux pump gene expression in a clinical isolate *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* by real-time reverse transcription PCR. *Microb Drug Resist* 14: 7–11.
- Kaatz GW (2002) Inhibition of bacterial efflux pumps: a new strategy to combat increasing antimicrobial agent resistance. *Expert Opin Emerg Drugs* 7: 223–233.
- Kaatz GW (2005) Bacterial efflux pump inhibition. Curr Opin Investig D 6: 191–198.
- Kim SY, Shin SJ, Song CH, Jo EK, Kim HJ & Park JK (2008) Identification of novel metronidazole-inducible genes in

- *Mycobacterium smegmatis* using a customized amplification library. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **282**: 282–289.
- Klyachko KA & Neyfakh AA (1998) Paradoxical enhancement of the activity of a bacterial multidrug transporter caused by substitutions of a conserved residue. *J Bacteriol* **180**: 2817–2821.
- Levy SB (1992) Active efflux mechanisms for antimicrobial resistance. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **36**: 695–703.
- Li XZ & Nikaido H (2004) Efflux-mediated drug resistance in bacteria. *Drugs* **64**: 159–204.
- Li XZ & Nikaido H (2009) Efflux-mediated drug resistance in bacteria: an update. *Drugs* **69**: 1555–1623.
- Li XZ, Poole K & Nikaido H (2003) Contributions of MexAB-OprM and an EmrE homolog to intrinsic resistance of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* to aminoglycosides and dyes. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **47**: 27–33.
- Li XZ, Zhang L & Nikaido H (2004) Efflux pump-mediated intrinsic drug resistance in *Mycobacterium smegmatis*. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **48**: 2415–2423.
- Liu J, Takiff HE & Nikaido H (1996) Active efflux of fluoroquinolones in *Mycobacterium smegmatis* mediated by LfrA, a multidrug efflux pump. *J Bacteriol* **178**: 3791–3795.
- Lomovskaya O & Bostian KA (2006) Practical applications and feasibility of efflux pump inhibitors in the clinic—a vision for applied use. *Biochem Pharmacol* 71: 910–918.
- Lomovskaya O, Warren MS, Lee A *et al.* (2001) Identification and characterization of inhibitors of multidrug resistance efflux pumps in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*: novel agents for combination therapy. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **45**: 105–116.
- Louw GE, Warren RM, Gey van Pittius NC, McEvoy CR, Van Helden PD & Victor TC (2009) A balancing act: efflux/influx in mycobacterial drug resistance. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **53**: 3181–3189.
- Louw GE, Warren RM, Gey van Pittius NC *et al.* (2011) Rifampicin reduces susceptibility to ofloxacin in rifampicin resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* through efflux. *Am J Resp Crit Care*, DOI:10.1164/rccm.201011-1924OC.
- Martins M, Santos B, Martins A, Viveiros M, Couto I, Cruz A, Pages JM, Molnar J, Fanning S & Amaral L (2006) An instrument-free method for the demonstration of efflux pump activity of bacteria. *In Vivo* **20**: 657–664.
- McDermott PF, White DG, Podglajen I, Alekshun MN & Levy SB (1998) Multidrug resistance following expression of the *Escherichia coli marA* gene in *Mycobacterium smegmatis*. *J Bacteriol* **180**: 2995–2998.
- McMurry L, Petrucci RE & Levy SB (1980) Active efflux of tetracycline encoded by four genetically different tetracycline resistance determinants in *Escherichia coli*. *P Natl Acad Sci USA* **77**: 3974–3977.
- Migliori GB, Loddenkemper R, Blasi F & Raviglione MC (2007) 125 years after Robert Koch's discovery of the tubercle bacillus: the new XDR-TB threat. Is 'science' enough to tackle the epidemic? *Eur Respir J* **29**: 423–427.
- Milano A, Pasca MR, Provvedi R, Lucarelli AP, Manina G, Ribeiro AL, Manganelli R & Riccardi G (2009) Azole resistance in

- Mycobacterium tuberculosis is mediated by the MmpS5-MmpL5 efflux system. Tuberculosis 89: 84–90.
- Morris RP, Nguyen L, Gatfield J *et al.* (2005) Ancestral antibiotic resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *P Natl Acad Sci USA* **102**: 12200–12205.
- Nikaido H (1998) Multiple antibiotic resistance and efflux. *Curr Opin Microbiol* 1: 516–523.
- Nikaido H & Zgurskaya HI (1999) Antibiotic efflux mechanisms. *Curr Opin Infect Dis* 12: 529–536.
- Nomura K, Ogawa M, Miyamoto H, Muratani T & Taniguchi H (2004) Antibiotic susceptibility of glutaraldehyde-tolerant *Mycobacterium chelonae* from bronchoscope washing machines. *Am J Infect Control* **32**: 185–188.
- Ordway D, Viveiros M, Leandro C, Bettencourt R, Almeida J, Martins M, Kristiansen JE, Molnar J & Amaral L (2003) Clinical concentrations of thioridazine kill intracellular multidrug-resistant Mycobacterium tuberculosis. Antimicrob Agents Ch 47: 917–922.
- Palomino JC, Fernandes-Ramos D & Almeida da Silva P (2009) New anti-tuberculosis drugs: strategies, sources and new molecules. *Curr Med Chem* **16**: 1898–1904.
- Parent MA, Goenka R, Murphy E, LeVier K, Carreiro N, Golding B, Ferguson G, Roop RM, Walker GC & Baldwin CL (2007) Brucella abortus bacA mutant induces greater proinflammatory cytokines than the wild-type parent strain. Microbes Infect 9: 55–62.
- Pasca MR, Guglierame P, Arcesi F, Bellinzoni M, De Rossi E & Riccardi G (2004) Rv2686c-Rv2687c-Rv2688c, an ABC fluoroquinolone efflux pump in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **48**: 3175–3178.
- Pasca MR, Guglierame P, De Rossi E, Zara F & Riccardi G (2005) mmpL7 gene of Mycobacterium tuberculosis is responsible for isoniazid efflux in Mycobacterium smegmatis. Antimicrob Agents Ch 49: 4775–4777.
- Paulsen IT & Lewis K (2001) Microbial multidrug efflux: introduction. *J Mol Microb Biotech* **3**: 143–144.
- Paulsen IT, Chen J, Nelson KE & Saier MH Jr (2001) Comparative genomics of microbial drug efflux systems. *J Mol Microb Biotech* **3**: 145–150.
- Pethe K, Swenson DL, Alonso S, Anderson J, Wang C & Russell DG (2004) Isolation of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* mutants defective in the arrest of phagosome maturation. *P Natl Acad Sci USA* **101**: 13642–13647.
- Piddock LJ (2006a) Clinically relevant chromosomally encoded multidrug resistance efflux pumps in bacteria. *Clin Microbiol Rev* 19: 382–402.
- Piddock LJ (2006b) Multidrug-resistance efflux pumps not just for resistance. *Nat Rev Microbiol* **4**: 629–636.
- Putman M, van Veen HW & Konings WN (2000) Molecular properties of bacterial multidrug transporters. *Microbiol Mol Biol R* 64: 672–693.
- Ramaswamy S & Musser JM (1998) Molecular genetic basis of antimicrobial agent resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: 1998 update. *Tuber Lung Dis* **79**: 3–29.

- Ramon-Garcia S, Martin C, Ainsa JA & De Rossi E (2006) Characterization of tetracycline resistance mediated by the efflux pump Tap from *Mycobacterium fortuitum*. *J Antimicrob Chemoth* 57: 252–259.
- Ramon-Garcia S, Martin C, De Rossi E & Aínsa JA (2007)
 Contribution of the Rv2333c efflux pump (the Stp protein)
 from *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* to intrinsic antibiotic
 resistance in *Mycobacterium bovis* BCG. *J Antimicrob Chemoth*59: 544–547.
- Ramón-García S, Martín C, Thompson CJ & Aínsa JA (2009) Role of the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* P55 efflux pump in intrinsic drug resistance, oxidative stress responses, and growth. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **53**: 3675–3682.
- Rodrigues L, Wagner D, Viveiros M, Sampaio D, Couto I, Vavra M, Kern WV & Amaral L (2008) Thioridazine and chlorpromazine inhibition of ethidium bromide efflux in *Mycobacterium avium* and *Mycobacterium smegmatis*. *J Antimicrob Chemoth* **61**: 1076–1082.
- Saier MH Jr, Yen MR, Noto K, Tamang DG & Elkan C (2009) The transporter classification database: recent advances. *Nucleic Acids Res* 37: D274–D278.
- Sander P, De Rossi E, Boddinghaus B, Cantoni R, Branzoni M, Bottger EC, Takiff H, Rodriquez R, Lopez G & Riccardi G (2000) Contribution of the multidrug efflux pump LfrA to innate mycobacterial drug resistance. FEMS Microbiol Lett 193: 19–23.
- Schaller A, Sun Z, Yang Y, Somoskovi A & Zhang Y (2002) Salicylate reduces susceptibility of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* to multiple antituberculosis drugs. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **46**: 2636–2639.
- Sharma S, Kumar M, Sharma S, Nargotra A, Koul S & Khan IA (2010) Piperine as an inhibitor of Rv1258c, a putative multidrug efflux pump of Mycobacterium tuberculosis. J Antimicrob Chemoth 65: 1694–1701.
- Siddiqi N, Das R, Pathak N, Banerjee S, Ahmed N, Katoch VM & Hasnain SE (2004) Mycobacterium tuberculosis isolate with a distinct genomic identity overexpresses a tap-like efflux pump. Infection 32: 109–111.
- Silva PE, Bigi F, Santangelo MP, Romano MI, Martín C, Cataldi A & Aínsa JA (2001) Characterization of P55, a multidrug efflux pump in *Mycobacterium bovis* and *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **45**: 800–804.
- Spies FS, da Silva PE, Ribeiro MO, Rossetti ML & Zaha A (2008) Identification of mutations related to streptomycin resistance in clinical isolates of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and possible involvement of efflux mechanism. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* 52: 2947–2949.

- Takiff HE, Cimino M, Musso MC, Weisbrod T, Martinez R, Delgado MB, Salazar L, Bloom BR & Jacobs WR Jr (1996) Efflux pump of the proton antiporter family confers low-level fluoroquinolone resistance in *Mycobacterium smegmatis*. *P Natl Acad Sci USA* **93**: 362–366.
- Tseng TT, Gratwick KS, Kollman J, Park D, Nies DH, Goffeau A & Saier MH Jr (1999) *J Mol Microb Biotech* 1: 107–125.
- van Soolingen D, Hernandez-Pando R, Orozco H, Aguilar D, Magis-Escurra C, Amaral L, van Ingen J & Boeree MJ (2010) The antipsychotic thioridazine shows promising therapeutic activity in a mouse model of multidrug-resistant tuberculosis. *PLoS One* 5: e12640.
- Viveiros M, Portugal I, Bettencourt R, Victor TC, Jordaan AM, Leandro C, Ordway D & Amaral L (2002) Isoniazid-induced transient high-level resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **46**: 2804–2810.
- Viveiros M, Martins M, Couto I, Rodrigues L, Spengler G, Martins A, Kristiansen JE, Molnar J & Amaral L (2008) New methods for the identification of efflux mediated MDR bacteria, genetic assessment of regulators and efflux pump constituents, characterization of efflux systems and screening for inhibitors of efflux pumps. *Curr Drug Targets* 9: 760–778.
- Webber MA & Piddock LJ (2003) The importance of efflux pumps in bacterial antibiotic resistance. *J Antimicrob Chemoth* **51**: 9–11.
- Wilson M, DeRisi J, Kristensen HH, Imboden P, Rane S, Brown PO & Schoolnik GK (1999) Exploring drug-induced alterations in gene expression in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* by microarray hybridization. *P Natl Acad Sci USA* **96**: 12833–12838.
- World Health Organization (1997) Anti-tuberculosis drug resistance in the world. The WHO/IUATLD Global Project on Anti-tuberculosis Drug Resistance Surveillance 1994–1997. Geneva, World Health Organization, 1997 (WHO/TB/97.229)
- World Health Organization (2010a) *Treatment of Tuberculosis Guidelines, WHO/HTM/TB/2009.420*, 4th edn. WHO, Geneva.
- World Health Organization (2010b) Multidrug and extensively drug-resistant TB (M/XDR-TB): 2010 global report on surveillance and response. 2010. WHO/HTM/TB/2010.3
- Yamada H, Kurose-Hamada S, Fukuda Y, Mitsuyama J, Takahata M, Minami S, Watanabe Y & Narita H (1997) Quinolone susceptibility of *norA*-disrupted *Staphylococcus aureus*. *Antimicrob Agents Ch* **41**: 2308–2309.
- Zhang Y & Telenti A (2000) Genetics of drug resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis. Molecular Genetics of Mycobacteria* (Hatfull GF & Jacobs WR, ed), pp. 235–254. ASM, Washington, DC.